



NGO STRENGTHENING FOR WOMEN INCLUSION REPORT

FINAL

Tuesday, January 31, 2012

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by Deloitte Consulting LLP.

NGO STRENGTHENING FOR WOMEN INCLUSION REPORT

FINAL

USAID ECONOMIC PROSPERITY INITIATIVE (EPI)

CONTRACT NUMBER: AID-114-C-10-00004

DELOITTE CONSULTING LLP

USAID/CAUCASUS

TUESDAY, JANUARY 31, 2012

DISCLAIMER:

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

DATA

Author(s): Anne G. Williams and Sabrina Dorman

Reviewed By: Natia Vepkhvadze, Human and Institutional Capacity Development Manager

Name of Component: Program Management and Cross-cutting

Practice Area: Women, Youth

Key Words: capacity, curriculum, Economic Prosperity Initiative, focus group, gender, Making Cents International; NGO, value chain, women, youth.

ABSTRACT

Georgian NGOs working at the intersection of women and economic development are well positioned to support the inclusion of more women-owned SMEs and farm families (including women and youth) in Georgia EPI value chain activities. Many Georgian NGOs and private consultants deliver business skills training. The trainer quality is uneven, and the curriculum is often generic and lacks relevancy to a specific value chain. By building the capacity of women- and youth-focused Georgian NGOs to develop their curriculum design skills and focus group methodology to design relevant, stimulating curriculum, these NGOs will be better prepared to support Georgian women working in EPI value chains. Competitive Georgian women business leaders and women-focused business associations have potential to model leadership and mentor young men and women entrepreneurs.

ABBREVIATIONS

AEC™	Agricultural Enterprise Curriculum
AYEG	Association of Young Economists of Georgia
B2B	Business-to-Business
CIDA	Civil Development Agency (Kvemo Kartli)
EPI	Economic Prosperity Initiative
GAWB	Georgian Association of Women in Business
GWBC	Caucasia-Georgian Business Development Centers
IDP	Internally Displaced Persons
IBWNG	International Business Women's Network-Georgia
MCI	Making Cents International
SME	Small- and Medium-sized Enterprise
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

CONTENTS

I.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
II.	APPENDICES.....	4
A.	BACKGROUND	5
B.	METHODOLOGY	6
C.	FINDINGS.....	10
D.	RECOMMENDATIONS	14
E.	CDI TRAINING DATA.....	17
F.	OTHER MATERIALS ATTACHED BY REFERENCE.....	20

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Georgia Economic Prosperity Initiative (EPI) is a four-year USD 40 million program to improve country-level competitiveness. A recent report, prepared by Making Cents International (MCI) for EPI¹ made specific recommendations for EPI Year 2 activities that can enhance women- and youth-owned Small and Medium Enterprise (SME) linkages to EPI value chains. One strategy is to build capacity of Georgian NGOs through training on curriculum design, leadership, and mentoring. For purposes of this report, the term NGO refers to nongovernmental, community development, and civil society organizations; farmer associations or cooperatives; and trade associations.

This report describes two activities to build NGO capacity:

- To design and adapt business skills curriculum, providing the potential to improve the sustainability of the NGOs and deliver a positive impact on women and youth involved in or who want to start businesses.
- To explore leadership and mentoring potential among women's business associations and successful women business owners.

In order to develop NGO capacity to design and adapt business skills curriculum, Curriculum Design Instrument (CDI) training was developed. The CDI consists of a CDI Trainer Guide and CDI Templates used in curriculum design and conducting focus groups. The CDI training is designed to be practical and useful for NGOs who are not curriculum experts. The topics of the training include curriculum design approach and focus group methods, and curriculum adaptation. The expected outcome of the CDI training is that Georgian NGOs will be better prepared to enhance the knowledge, skills, and attitudes of businesswomen and entrepreneurs in EPI agricultural value chains.

The final CDI materials were developed collaboratively and incorporate suggestions and feedback from NGOs.

CDI training content includes the three curriculum design categories (structure, pedagogy, content); understanding curriculum design context: identifying and mapping the four functional areas of a value chain (production, processing, distribution/wholesale and retail); mapping gender roles by task in the value chain; types of focus groups and methods of conducting a market research focus group; and applying new information to curriculum design.

Forty-nine participants (29 women, 20 men, five under age 25), representing 34 NGOs have received the CDI training in the TOT and the regional pilots.

The CDI Training of Trainers (TOT) was conducted by two MCI Master Trainers at the EPI office in Tbilisi, Georgia, on December 13–14, 2011. Six representatives (five women, one man, none under age 25) of four umbrella Georgian NGOs, AYEG, GAWB, IBWNG, and GBDC, completed the TOT. TOT participants found the training structure and content useful. The value chain mapping activity and gender mapping along the value chain were identified

¹ Williams, Anne G. Gender And Youth Inclusion In EPI Value Chains, October 2011

as key learning points. They experienced a demonstration of a simulation-type curriculum example from MCI's Agricultural Enterprise Curriculum™. Simulations are a type of learning tool new to most Georgian trainers. TOT participants conducted a practical exercise during the TOT with a focus group of four businesswomen, on the topic of Leadership.

Following the TOT, four regional pilots step-down CDI trainings were held for local and regional NGOs in Rustavi (Kvemo Kartli), Gori (Shida Kartli), Batumi (Adjara), and Orzugeti (Guria). The trainings were conducted by the CDI-certified Trainers from the umbrella NGOs.

A total of 43 participants (24 women, 19 men, four under age 25) attended the regional pilots, representing 30 NGOs and four other entities. With the exception of two participants in the Batumi pilot, and two employees of NEO (Chemonics' USAID project) at the Gori training, all participants work in agriculture as large or smallholder producers, input suppliers, or processors in one of the EPI priority value chains of hazelnuts, mandarins, and open field vegetables. As part of their training, the regional participants conducted focus groups. A total of 29 focus group members (eight men, 21 women) participated in the practical session. All were in hazelnut, mandarin, or open field vegetable value chains. Most were SMEs or smallholders.

All of the regional CDI training participants found value in the CDI training. The training met most of their expectations. Expectations that were not met were generally off the topic (i.e., advocacy, technology). They said it gave them new skills, opened their eyes to new ideas, and will be very useful and practical for training, curriculum design, and conducting focus groups in their areas of practice. Although most had some training experience, they remarked that CDI training gave them a systematic approach and framework to use. They commented that the training helped them see the connection between curriculum design, the functional areas of value chains, and focus groups.

For the most part, the trainers were able to convey the key learning points of the training. All trainers need improvement in time management, and tying discussions back to the main topic of curriculum design. The IBWNG trainer needs additional coaching and content review before rollout.

To explore the knowledge, skills, and attitudes about leadership training and mentoring among successful businesswomen, two meetings were held with women's business association members and women business owners in Tbilisi. One meeting with four members was held as part of the CDI TOT. A separate meeting was held with 10 women business owners and senior managers. One NGO director also attended. Senior EPI management and other staff (all female) participated in the summary discussion. The women examined leadership characteristics, perceptions, and business challenges in the Georgian context. They were quite supportive of the idea of providing mentoring to aspiring businesswomen within a set of clearly defined expectations about time commitments.

Key recommendations for future EPI activities to support women's activities include:

- Identify entry points and potential areas of collaboration between the EPI agricultural curricula being developed for mandarin and open field vegetable value chain actors, and upgraded financial management, project planning and risk management (business skills) curricula and agribusiness curricula of AYES and GBDC.
- Provide continued capacity building to umbrella Georgian NGOs AYES and GBDC, and to other regional NGOs identified during the pilots and during the previously reported NGO Capacity Audit, such as Civil Development Agency (CIDA) (Rustavi pilot), EcoFarm Association (Batumi pilot), International Education Center (Batumi pilot and NGO

Capacity Audit); Guria Youth Resource Center (Orzugeti pilot), through coaching in structured reviews and upgrades of their business skills and agribusiness training curricula to ensure high-quality content and up-to-date delivery methods, including possible adaptation of the MCI AEC™ simulation. Develop and deliver a pilot training to farmers using upgraded curricula. Coordinate pilot training to coincide with second or third round of Knowledge Plot agricultural technical training in the mandarin and open field vegetable value chains. Actively recruit female farmers and farm families (men and women) for the pilot trainings.

- Fund AYES, GBDC, and GAWB to provide a value chain mapping training to agricultural value chain actors, such as banks and insurance companies to build their understanding of agricultural processes and the role of women in various activities. The interactive value chain session from the CDI can be used with minimal adaptation for this purpose.
- Explore demand among the entire IBWNG board to prepare a collaborative strategic plan. Provide funds and a neutral facilitator to prepare a strategic plan if it is desired. The organization has a better chance of achieving its stated mission of mentoring women entrepreneurs if it has a clear strategy to implement its mission.
- Provide AYES and GBDC with funds for the rollout of the CDI training to the regional and district level. They are prepared and have the capacity.
- Provide GAWB with funds to rollout the CDI training after their trainers receive some mentoring and coaching from AYES trainers on facilitation techniques.

Additional recommendations are found in Appendix D.

II. APPENDICES

- A. BACKGROUND**
- B. METHODOLOGY**
- C. FINDINGS**
- D. RECOMMENDATIONS**
- E. CDI TRAINING DATA**
- F. OTHER MATERIALS ATTACHED BY REFERENCE**

A. BACKGROUND

EPI AND GENDER

Georgia Economic Prosperity Initiative (EPI) is a four-year USD 40 million program to improve country-level competitiveness. In September–October 2011, MCI² conducted an in-country assessment to identify and recommend ways to enhance women and youth³ integration in EPI value chains. The focus of the evaluation was women- and youth-centered NGOs. The report made specific recommendations for EPI Year 2 activities that can enhance women- and youth-owned Small- and Medium-Enterprise (SME) linkages to EPI value chain. Although SMEs are not a high-priority target group for EPI activities, they are integral to creating, building, and sustaining a value chain.

One recommendation in the Gender and Youth Inclusion in EPI Value Chains report was to build capacity of Georgian NGOs. Georgian NGOs are an important link between their constituents and the private sector in targeted value chains. NGOs that work in economic development and with women are in a strong position to help their constituents who own or manage businesses enhance business opportunities in EPI value chain activities. Many women- and youth-oriented NGOs had been identified in previous studies⁴; however, their institutional capacity was not well known.

EPI identified a core group of strong women- and youth-oriented NGOs that have the potential to partner with EPI. A participatory competency assessment tool (NGO Capacity Audit) was developed. In October 2011, four umbrella NGOs received a TOT on the NGO Capacity Audit tool and initiated a capacity and training needs assessment pilot of selected national and regional NGO serving women and youth. The umbrella NGOs are Association of Young Economists of Georgia (AYEG), Georgian Association of Women in Business (GAWB), Caucasia–Georgian Business Development Center (GBDC), and International Business Women’s Network of Georgia (IBWNG).

The NGO Capacity Audit pilot revealed mixed capacity among the NGOs that participated in the pilot. The training needs assessment section of the NGO Capacity Audit (which was, by design, a few number of questions and limited to business skills) showed that all the NGOs saw a high need for business skills training for their women and youth constituents.

As a result of this finding, MCI and EPI agreed that building the capacity of Georgian NGOs to design and adapt business skills curriculum had the potential to improve the sustainability of the NGOs and provide positive impact on women and youth who have or want to start businesses in the EPI priority value chains. In addition, a series of meetings were held during this assignment to explore the potential of leadership and mentoring training among women’s business associations and successful women entrepreneurs. Women mentoring other women can be a powerful way to support the growth and competitiveness of Georgian women in business.

² Williams, Anne G. Gender And Youth Inclusion In EPI Value Chains; Making Cents International; Georgia EPI; October 2011

³ Young men and women between the ages of 15 and 24.

⁴ See bibliography

B. METHODOLOGY

CURRICULUM DESIGN INSTRUMENT (CDI)

Curriculum design requires a framework built on structure, pedagogy and content. The CDI was developed to provide a framework for curriculum design for Georgian NGOs. The CDI materials include:

- Trainer Guide, used by CDI-certified trainers to deliver the CDI training to end users: local and regional NGOs
- CDI Templates, for use by the local and regional NGOs. These are templates to help design and adapt curricula; a curriculum map, and a focus group questionnaire.

The CDI training is designed to be practical and useful for NGOs who are not curriculum experts, but who want to develop a working knowledge of curriculum design, enabling them to assess the quality of curricula offered by others; adapt open source curricula, or develop simple curriculum internally. It can be delivered in one-and-a half to two days by certified CDI trainers.

The CDI training includes sessions on focus group methods, utilizing community-based, participatory best practices. Focus groups can be a powerful source of information for curriculum design. Many times, however, a focus group is convened with little thought beyond “discussion”. As with curriculum design, effective focus group methods require a structure in order to make the information produced during the focus group useful to the curriculum design topic.

At the trainer’s discretion, the CDI can be expanded by adding a session in which end users review an actual curriculum and examine its structure, pedagogy, and content. This is entirely optional, and the quality of the CDI training is not compromised if the optional session is not included.

The CDI is oriented toward women, business skills training, and agricultural value chains. The agricultural sector and enhanced competitiveness are high priority for EPI, and USAID has identified women’s inclusion in programming as a requirement.

The expected outcome of the CDI training is that Georgian NGOs will be better prepared to enhance the knowledge, skills, and attitudes of women business owners and entrepreneurs in EPI agricultural value chains.

“CDI TRAINING OF TRAINERS”

Six representatives from the four umbrella Georgian NGOs, AYES(2), GAWB(2), IBWNG(1), and GBDC (1), participated in a CDI Training of Trainers conducted by two MCI Master Trainers at the EPI office in Tbilisi, Georgia, on December 13–14, 2011. There were five women and one man. The training was for two full days and included a practical session of conducting a focus group.

The participants who successfully completed the CDI TOT were certified as CDI training course trainers. They deliver the CDI training course to end users in step-down trainings. The CDI step-down training end users are local and regional NGOs. Certified CDI trainers are not certified to train other trainers.

The TOT content included facilitation techniques, and the content of the step-down training.

TOT participants learned the three curriculum design categories (structure, pedagogy, content); curriculum design context: participants identified and mapped the four functional areas of a vegetable value chain (production, processing, distribution/wholesale, and retail) and mapped gender roles in selected areas.

Participants learned uses and methods of focus groups. The four uses of focus groups are to identify a problem or opportunity, planning, implementation, and assessment. For curriculum design purposes, a focus group is typically used to identify a problem or opportunity and/or planning. For curriculum adaptation purposes, a focus group can be used during implementation (as when conducting a pilot training of new or revised curriculum) or for assessment of curriculum impacts.

Participants learned the four topics to consider when organizing a focus group (planning, recruiting, facilitating, analysis, and reporting.). They learned and practiced how to design questions and capture information during a focus group, analyze the information and use it to populate a curriculum map, and conduct a debrief at the end of a training session.

The participants had many opportunities to reflect and comment on the structure, pedagogy, and content of the CDI training. Summary debriefs were held with the TOT participants following the pilot trainings, to get their input on the CDI curriculum structure, pedagogy, and content. The final CDI was, therefore, cooperatively developed.

During one session in the TOT, the participants experienced a simulation (board game) from the MCI Agricultural Enterprise Curriculum (AEC)™. To our knowledge, the only business skills curriculum for adult learners in Georgia that uses a simulation is the MCI Business Simulation™ Modules 1–4. Currently, AYEG is the only certified trainer for the Georgian language Business Simulation™ in Georgia.⁵ The TOT session using the AEC™ introduced the umbrella organizations to simulation as a teaching tool for agricultural value chains. This simulation session is not included in the step-down training, and TOT participants are not certified to deliver the AEC™.

CDI REGIONAL PILOT STEP-DOWN TRAININGS

Following the TOT, four regional pilot step-down trainings were conducted with local and regional NGOs. The CDI step-down training is comprised of one full day and one half day.

The umbrella NGOs collaborated extensively on the recruitment of focus group members and logistics for the regional pilot trainings.

The CDI step-down training in Rustavi, Kvemo Kartli took place on December 15–16, 2011, at the office of CIDA. The training was facilitated by Ketevan Patsatsia of AYEG. Of the 15 participants (13 male, two female, one under age 25), 14 represented NGOs, associations, or farmer's cooperatives and 1 represented a local government municipality. The cooperative members were directly involved in agribusiness (input supply, wheat, dairy).

Rustavi CDI training participants had no experience in curriculum design or focus group methodology and little to no experience in delivering training. The focus group assembled as

⁵ Mary Ellen Chatwin, a Georgian resident is certified to deliver the English language Business Simulation™ for purposes of teaching English.

part of the CDI training in Rustavi was composed of two male owners and operators of large farms growing wheat and maize, and two female operators of family farms growing open field vegetables and fruit. The recruitment of women vegetable growers proved difficult due to time constraint for planning the focus group activity.

The CDI training in Gori (Shida Kartli) took place on December 16–17, 2011, at the Gori Business Incubator, the women's entrepreneurship and training center run by GAWB. The training was facilitated by Nino Elizbarashvili and Tamar Dolidze of GAWB. The nine participants were all women. None were under 25. Seven were representatives of rural NGOs or CSOs. Two were community-based employees of Chemonics on the USAID NEO project. Shida Kartli is primarily an agricultural region with a large Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) population. The constituents of these organizations are mostly engaged in small-scale agribusiness, many in the EPI open field value chains.

The Gori training participants had some experience in training and in designing trainings. They stated that their training design did not follow any curriculum design structure, and they had not given much thought to focus group methods.

The focus group in Gori was composed of 12 women from rural areas. They were all smallholder farmers (vegetables, fruits, small livestock - bees, poultry, rabbits, and sheep - mostly for family consumption). These women are IDPs. The topic of the focus group was to identify problems confronting women in the agricultural sector.

The CDI training in Orzugeti (Guria) took place at the Guria Youth Center on December 19–20, 2011. The training was facilitated by Nino Ugulava of IBWNG. Twelve participants (11 male, one female, none under 25) attended one or both days. The participants represented seven NGOs and farmer associations, one laboratory (soil samples), and a journalist from a local agricultural newspaper. All participants were engaged in agriculture; most were producers of hazelnuts and/or mandarins. The remainder produced flowers and vegetables for both home consumption and commercial sale.

All participants had conducted some training and were familiar with the concept of curriculum design, although few had experience using a structured approach. In discussions, it was clear that there was some confusion between pedagogy and content. They were familiar with focus groups and were able to develop questions. They were less familiar with following focus group methods or how to apply the information from a focus group to specific curriculum design.

The focus group in Orzugeti was composed of three men and three women hazelnut farmers. The discussion concerned hazelnut associations and market access.

The CDI training in Batumi (Adjara) took place in a café' (closed for the occasion). The seven training participants (four women/three men) represented one regional farmer's association, two civil society groups, an education center, and a free journalists' NGO. This group was the youngest of all the regional trainings; four participants were under age 25. All participants had attended a significant number of trainings and three had previously attended EPI trainings (agricultural and NGO Capacity Audit). The training was effectively facilitated by George Mikabadze of GBDC-Batumi. He encouraged active participation; followed the CDI manual and managed clear, effective delivery of content.

The focus group in Batumi of three men and four women was conducted effectively and centered on mandarin production and sales.

LEADERSHIP AND MENTORING

Meetings were held with women business owners to explore their knowledge, skills and attitudes about leadership training and mentoring. Two focus groups were conducted on the topic of Businesswomen's Leadership and Mentoring.

The first focus group was held during the TOT with four members of IBWNG. These women represented retail, B2B, and agribusinesses. All were over 25 years of age, and have been in business for at least five years.

A second focus group was held in Tbilisi on December 23, 2011. The 10 members of this focus group represented banking, stock brokerage, agribusiness, and management consulting businesses. None were under age 25. The EPI Chief of Party, as well as eight women managers and staff members from EPI also attended. They participated in the discussion period at the end of the focus group. The umbrella NGOs AYEG, and IBWNG assisted in finding candidates for the leadership and mentoring focus groups.

Both groups were asked similar key questions, using a structured focus group method about their understanding and experience with leadership and mentoring as it relates to their position as successful women in business.

C. FINDINGS

CDI TOT

Findings

The MCI learning objectives for the TOT were mostly met. The participants stated their expectations for the course were mostly met. The TOT was built around the theme of the perspective of business skills training needs of women in agriculture.

Several participants said that although they vaguely understood what a value chain was, they did not know the functional areas and had not considered the respective roles of men and women in specific value chain activities as a way to understand opportunities to bring gender equity to a value chain. Discussion revolved around what women currently do in the value chain versus what activities they could do, given appropriate training. Tools and equipment were cited as barriers to women's ability to perform certain activities. During these discussions the participants were able to relate their observations to methods of curriculum design for women operating in the agricultural value chains.

The participants identified the importance of training for other actors who control women's access in the value chains, i.e., bankers, insurance companies, transporters, and manufacturers. These actors can directly influence the ability of women to participate fully in value chains and it is important for them to understand agricultural processes and women as agricultural actors. The participants said that it would be ideal for the NGOs to be able to deliver these kinds of trainings, because of their role as trainers working with women.

During the TOT, participants conducted a focus group. Originally conceived as an agricultural sector focus group, the topic was changed to Leadership and Mentoring for Successful Businesswomen because of difficulties encountered in recruiting agricultural sector focus group members from Tbilisi. IBWNG was able to provide four of its members to be the focus group.

For the TOT focus group, TOT participants successfully designed a logical sequence of topical questions on the understanding of leadership and mentoring among successful women entrepreneurs. The conversation was well directed by the facilitators to access useful information on the focus groups topic. In the focus group debrief, one of the focus group facilitators acknowledged that she overstepped her role as facilitator by interjecting her opinion in the discussion. One of the observers recognized she overstepped her role as an observer by joining in the conversation with her own experience to answer the focus group questions.

TOT participants noted that the focus group was successful because they had good planning, invited the right participants, divided roles, created a friendly environment, and asked concrete questions in a logical sequence. They were surprised that the participants seemed to find the focus group useful for themselves rather than a one-way flow of information to the facilitators. They learned from each other through shared experiences in the directed discussion. TOT participants stated that for future focus group design, they would invite a greater diversity of participants, use exercises to make the focus group fun and interactive, purposefully structure questions to eliminate their own bias, and use language in their questions that is sensitive to the participants (such as people in regions outside Tbilisi). To organize the outcomes of the focus group, TOT participants were

introduced to the tool of assessing knowledge, skills, and attitudes (KSA) of focus group participants. The majority of the participants had no prior experience using KSAs as an assessment tool.

In the post-training debrief, TOT participants stated that the majority of their expectations had been met. One participant expressed wanting expanded curriculum design training to go further into the process. Others expressed the need for more time on curriculum design using actual curriculum as examples and tools. It was suggested that, if the TOT was delivered again, an activity be built in to the CDI TOT for Master Trainers to model a session followed by the participants practicing delivering the session. Participants wanted more time to plan the focus group and more time between the TOT and the pilots. All commented that it was a lot of material for two days, but they also wanted to learn more, so maybe the training should be longer than two days.

TOT participants commented that the Trainer Guide was a very good tool and that they typically never have a trainer's manual for training. The CDI Templates include a template for structuring training sessions for a trainer's manual. TOT Participants found the "Parking Lot" tool to be very useful and said they would definitely use it in their future trainings.

All TOT participants expressed enthusiasm that EPI wanted to work with them; however, they had reservations about becoming too involved without a commitment from EPI that the project would continue to support their efforts in designing and delivering appropriate curriculum.

Rebecca Hoffman, EPI M&E director, noted that based on MCI's' recommendations from the previous assignment, gender, and age indicators had been inserted throughout EPI indicators.

CDI REGIONAL PILOTS (FINDINGS)

Findings

Four pilot CDI trainings were conducted by TOT graduate trainers from the umbrella NGOs to audiences primarily composed of local and regional NGOs. The Eastern Region step-down trainings were held in Rustavi (Kvemo Kartli) and Gori (Shida Kartli). The Western region trainings were held in Batumi (Adjara) and Orzugeti (Guria).

Eastern Region – Rustavi (Kvemo Kartli)

The Rustavi participants had some training experience. By the end of the course Rustavi participants reported that they gained new knowledge and skills that they plan to use with their members and constituents. The feedback from participants and the facilitator suggested extending the last session of the CDI with further practice in curriculum design.

The facilitator was excellent at reminding participants of topic of the curriculum being designed – business skills for vegetable farmers – and grounding them back to the course content. She was skilled at introducing gender issues to the conversation and in asking leading questions to draw targeted information from participants. Average time management skills on day one were improved on day two of the training.

Eastern Region – Gori (Shida Kartli)

The Gori participants stated that the CDI training helped them understand the connection between curriculum design and focus groups. The value chain exercise increased their

awareness of the functional areas of value chains and how value chain analysis can contribute to effective curriculum design. It gave them a system to use and opened their eyes to new practices. They stated the CDI methods will be very useful and practical in developing new training materials for their constituents, as well as assessing why some previous training worked, or didn't work.

The facilitators were able to convey the key learning points of the training. Some coaching was required by MCI during the focus group methods session. One facilitator was a very good trainer. She was excellent at connecting discussions to the key learning objectives of each session; excellent at grounding participants to curriculum design categories; confident use of material, especially the value chain and gender session; and good at drawing out participants' own learning. She showed good time management. The other trainer was less skilled.

Western region – Batumi (Adjara)

The Batumi participants liked the training, felt the topics were interesting, and liked the interactive environment. The most useful part of the course for participants was learning and practicing focus group methodology. It was interesting to discuss women's involvement in the mandarin value chain. All expectations were met, though it was suggested that more time would be needed to go further into curriculum design and it would have been ideal to have more participants for the course. These were very competent participants who will use this type of training. The focus group was very appropriate for discussion of the mandarin value chain.

The facilitator was excellent. He managed time well and delivered the content accurately. He adjusted training in the moment to the skills of the participants. He commented that with future practice and more preparation, he would have included more creative activities to replace straight discussion. He created an open and comfortable environment for participants.

Western region – Orzugeti (Guria)

The Orzugeti participants found the value chain mapping exercise helped them to learn more about the steps required to deliver a product (hazelnuts, kiwi, and mandarin) to market. The practical exercises were new, valuable techniques to learn. The discussions centering on farmer associations, while off-topic, revealed many common interests and they appreciated having a focus group methodology to help them do market research in future. They recommended a longer course, as the one-and-a-half days were not sufficient time to cover the topics. The focus group was well-selected for discussion of the hazelnut value chain.

The facilitator had the least training experience of all the TOT participants. She had difficulty keeping the participants and herself on the topic of curriculum design and required extensive coaching during both days. Her time management was excellent, however, often at the expense of the content. This facilitator will need extensive coaching to continue effectively.

WOMEN IN BUSINESS LEADERSHIP AND MENTORING

Four successful women business owners affiliated with IBWNG attended the CDI TOT focus group event on Wednesday, December 14, 2011. Ten women entrepreneurs attended a Leadership and Mentoring focus group on December 21, 2011.

The structured questions of the focus group method allowed these women to explore topics together. A surprising finding was that several women said that the EPI meeting was the first time they had really talked about and discussed leadership and mentoring with others. The women in the later focus group were unaware of any women's associations. Many of the women said they never called themselves leaders or thought of themselves as one. However, by the end of the session, they seemed to "own" their leadership position in a new way. They said they learned as much about themselves in the session as EPI learned from them.

Balancing responsibilities at work and at home was a challenge for all. The entrepreneurs in the TOT described the difficulties caused by the war with Russia and economic conditions. Conflict in the workplace, communications between male subordinates and female managers, and the perceptions about strong women were other topics.

They were supportive of mentoring other women, saying: "It would be great to get strong successful women to speak to others about their experiences and their knowledge." However, they said that any mentoring program would have to be structured and include clear directions as to time commitments and other expectations.

D. RECOMMENDATIONS

CDI TRAINING MATERIALS

The CDI training materials may be adapted following the regional rollouts. At the time of this report, the feedback from the NGOs has been incorporated into the CDI materials. The final drafts have been submitted as part of this report. We have no further recommendations on the materials at this time.

On a general note, many English business terms are translated differently into Georgian, depending on the experience and knowledge of the translator. It can be confusing for EPI participants if materials or translators (especially those translating from English or another language during a training) give different Georgian words for the same English term. For purposes of all EPI translations, we recommend:

- Engage AYESG to prepare a Glossary of Business Terms (such as “value chain,” “business skills,” and “implementation”) that can be used by EPI translators so the Georgian translations are consistent.

NGO CAPACITY BUILDING

Our experience with the umbrella and other NGOs during this assignment indicates that there are some gaps in their institutional capacity, particularly in the areas of project planning and time management, their ability to respond to proposals and, in some cases, creating a professional budget. The sustainability of an NGO rests on its ability to have good systems. NGOs are not private enterprise businesses, but especially in today’s environment, they must use business management tools to run efficiently and make the best use of limited donor funds. It is our assessment that the activities outlined below will help three of the umbrella organizations build their managerial capacity as they enhance and upgrade their own curriculum.

- Identify entry points and potential areas of collaboration between the EPI agricultural curricula being developed for mandarin and open field vegetable value chain actors and upgraded financial management, project planning and risk management (business skills) curricula, and agribusiness curricula of AYESG and GBDC.
- Provide continued capacity building to Georgian NGOs through coaching to AYESG and GBDC in structured reviews and upgrades of their business skills and agribusiness training curricula to ensure high quality content and up-to-date delivery methods, including possible adaptation of the MCI AEC™ simulation. Develop and deliver a pilot training to farmers using upgraded curricula. Coordinate pilot training to coincide with second or third round of Knowledge Plot agricultural technical training in the mandarin and open field vegetable value chains.
 - Ensure that any new curriculum development includes a pilot phase,
 - Award TOT certificates only after successful completion of pilots.
- Fund AYESG, GBDC, and GAWB to provide a value chain mapping training to agricultural value chain actors, such as banks and insurance companies, to build their understanding of agricultural processes and the role of women in various activities. The interactive value chain session from the CDI can be used with minimal adaptation for this purpose.

- Provide business skills training to regional NGOs, trade associations, farmer cooperatives, and other organizations along its value chains.

ROLLOUT OF CDI TRAINING TO REGIONAL AND DISTRICT NGOS

The CDI training is useful to regional and local NGOs, farmer cooperatives and trade associations.

- Provide AYEG and GBDC with funds for the rollout of the CDI training to the regional and district level. They are prepared and have the capacity.
- Provide GAWB CDI with funds to rollout after their trainers receive some mentoring and coaching from AYEG trainers on facilitation techniques.
- IBWNG does not have the capacity or the strategic direction at this time to assist EPI with CDI rollout.
 - The IBWNG trainer should be paired with one of the AYEG trainers for at least six rollout trainings in order to improve her facilitation techniques and mastery of the content. It is not recommended to fund IBWNG for rollout without this additional coaching.
 - Alternatively, MCI could deliver another TOT on the CDI (in combination with another assignment with EPI) to one or two other more mature, direction-specific NGOs to replace IBWNG.

LEADERSHIP AND MENTORING

There are several steps EPI can take to raise the visibility of successful women entrepreneurs. It is important in the Georgian context to avoid the perception that women are being promoted at the expense of men. A powerful message can be conveyed when women and men are shown as champions for each other's' success.

- Arrange for women entrepreneurs and senior managers from companies in EPI value chains to appear on talk radio, TV shows, and in newspaper articles, nationally and regionally.
- Sponsor high-level events featuring prominent women in government, business, NGOs, and associations, whose activities relate to EPI's objective. The women entrepreneurs described in this report can be useful resources to find other women business owners, senior managers, and community leaders, as well as men who mentor, support and champion women in business.
- Fund AYEG and GBDC to conduct Leadership and Mentoring discussion groups (similar format to that described in this report) in the regions, targeting women working along EPI value chains. As one woman said, "We share a lot of issues and in the regions these are probably more and even deeper."

Mentoring could be a valuable way to raise the profile of Georgian businesswomen and provide experienced guidance to young women and young men aspiring to entrepreneurship. IBWNG has the potential to be a lead organization for business mentoring but lacks clear direction.

- Provide funds and a facilitator to the IBWNG board to prepare a collaborative strategic plan so that it has a better chance of achieving its stated mission of mentoring women entrepreneurs.
- Mentorship training is strongly recommended. The concept of mentoring is new in Georgia and needs a strong foundation and unifying understanding in order to be taken seriously and be effective.
- Time management (project planning) training could be useful for both workplace time management and addressing the difficulties some Georgian businesswomen have in maintaining high standards at home and work.
- Conflict resolution, negotiation skills, and problem-solving techniques could benefit women in managing personnel and contract negotiations as business owners or employees. The businesswomen mentioned that small business owners would rather give up when they hit a problem and start anew rather than work through the difficulty.

E. CDI TRAINING DATA

CDI TOT NGO PARTICIPANTS

CDI TOT NGOs	Contact Information	Participants
Association of Young Economists of Georgia (AYEG)	Year Established: 1989 Address: 35, Orbeliani St. 0105, Tbilisi, Georgia Telephone: +995.32.92.28.39; 99.04.43; 93.64.75 Fax: 995.32.92.24.61 Email: office@economists.ge ; Website: www.economists.ge	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ana Katamidze, Head of the Board, ani@bcng.ge; ani@economists.ge; +995 (5)77.456.987; +995 (5)91.11.95.95 Ketevan Patsatsia, Economic Education Dept. Manger; +995.91.11.95.92; keti@economists.ge
Georgian Association of Women in Business (GAWB)	Year Established: 1993 Address: 7 Kipshidze St., Tbilisi, Georgia Telephone:(99532) 2913466 /M +995.577.41.95.57 Fax: :(99532) 2221356 Email:wbus@caucasus.net Website: www.gawb.ge	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nino Elizbarashvili, President, +995.577.41.95.57, wbus@caucasus.net Tamar Dolidze, +995.555.91.18.14
Georgian Business Development Center-Caucasia (GBDC)	Year Established:2002 (Tbilisi State University) Address: 11 University St, 0143, Tbilisi Georgia Telephone: +995.32.218.63.53/54 Website: www.gbdc.ge GBDC Caucasasia Batumi Office Shota Rustaveli State University. Registered December, 2008	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gigi (George) Mikabadze, Ex. Director GBDC Caucasasia Batumi Office, (Managing Director, Sense Selection) +995.97 12.24.58 +995.32.42.46.00; Email: g.mikabadze@sense.ge
International Business Women's Network Georgia (IBWNG)	Address: c/o AlterGroup Consulting Solutions, 5, Marjanishvili St, 0102 Tbilisi, Georgia Telephone/Fax: +995 32.2.207.305	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nino Ugulava, President, IBWNG; General Director Alter Group; Mobile: +995 577.11.33.77, Email: nugulava@ibwng.ge; nugulava@altergroup.ge; nugulava@gsba.org.ge.

CDI REGIONAL TRAINING NGO PARTICIPANTS: SUMMARY

NGO participant and focus group member registration details are available from Natia Vepkhvadze, EPI Human Capacity Institutional Development Manager (Women and Youth focal point), (5) 99 95 55 83, nvepkhvadze@epigeorgia.com

CDI Regional Trainings- NGOs	Trainer Contact Information	Participants
Western Georgia – Batumi (Adjara)	Lead NGO: GBDC Trainer: Gigi Mikabadze +995.97 12.24.58 +995.32.42.46.00 g.mikabadze@sense.ge	# Participants:7 # of men:3 # of women: 4 #participants under age 25:4 # NGOs:5
Western Georgia – Orzugeti	Lead NGO: IBWNG Trainer: Nino Ugulava, President, +995 577.11.33.77, nugulava@ibwng.ge ; nugulava@altergroup.ge ; nugulava@gsba.org.ge	# Participants:12 # of men:9 # of women: 3 # participants under age 25:0 # NGOs:7
Eastern Georgia – Rustavi (Kvemo Kartli)	Lead NGO: AYEG Trainer: Ketevan Patsatsia +995.91.11.95.92; keti@economists.ge	# Participants:15 # of men:13 # of women: 2 #participants under age 25:1 # NGOs:8
Eastern Georgia – Gori (Shida Kartli)	Lead NGO: GAWB Trainer: Nino Elizbarashvili, +995.577.41.95.57 wbus@caucasus.net Trainer: Tamar Dolidze, +995.555.91.18.14	# Participants:9 # of men: 0 # of women: 9 #participants under age 25:0 # NGOs:7

FOCUS GROUP MEMBER SUMMARY

CDI Focus Group Members	Summary: Member Profile	Summary: Affiliation
Western Georgia–Batumi (Adjara)–Mandarin Value Chain focus group	# Members:7 # of men:3 # of women: 4 # participants under age 25:4	#Business owner/manager: 4 # Associations: 4
Western Georgia–Orzugeti–Hazelnut Value Chain focus group	# Members:6 # of men:3 # of women: 3# participants under age 25:0	#Business owner/manager:–6 Hazelnut SMEs # Associations: 0
Eastern Georgia–Rustavi(Kvemo Kartli)–vegetable growers and maize producers	# Members:4 # of men:2 # of women: 2# participants under age 25:0	#Business owner/manager:4 SMEs, # Associations:1
Eastern Georgia–Gori (Shida Kartli)–Women entrepreneurs focus group	# Members: 12 # of men: 0 # of women: 12# participants under age 25:2	#Business owner/manager:12 (smallholders) # Associations:1
TOT (Tbilisi)–Leading Women Business Owners Leadership and Mentoring focus group	# Members:4 # of men: 0 # of women: 4 # participants under age 25:1	#Business owner/manager:4 # Associations:1
Leadership and Mentoring focus group–Tbilisi	# Members:10 # of men: 0 # of women: 10 # participants under age 25:1	#Business owner/manager:10 # Associations:1

F. OTHER MATERIALS ATTACHED BY REFERENCE

Participant and focus group contact information and registration forms from TOT, Regional trainings, and Women's Leadership and Mentoring focus group: (Natia Vepkhvadze, EPI Human Capacity Institutional Development Manager (Women and Youth focal point), (5) 99 95 55 83, nvepkhivadze@epigeorgia.com)

Anne Williams, Sabrina Dorman; Supplemental working notes on CDI training methodology and findings: (anne@makingcents.com; Sabrina@makingcents.com; Making Cents International, +1-202- 783-4090)

Williams, Anne G, and Sabrina Dorman; CDI Trainer Guide Final Draft, v2.0, CDI Templates Final Draft, v 1.0, Making Cents International, December 22, 2011

Aslanishvili, Teona; Recommendations for Youth Integration Strategies and NGO Capacity Mapping to Support Youth Integration, Georgia EPI, July 15, 2011

Duban, Elisabeth; Gender Assessment USAID/Georgia, DevTech Systems, Inc., June 2010, http://www.usaid.gov/our_work/cross-cutting_programs/wid/pubs/Georgia_Gender_Assessment_Jun-2010_508.pdf

Dzotsenidze, Shorena; Engendering Value Chains within the Framework of the EPI Program; Georgia EPI July 15, 2011

Williams, Anne G.; Gender and Youth Inclusion in EPI Value Chains; Making Cents International; Georgia EPI; November 17, 2011

**USAID Economic Prosperity Initiative (EPI)
6 Samgebro St.
Tbilisi, Georgia**

Phone: +995 32 43 89 24/25/26

Fax: +995 32 43 89 27